| 1 | SYLVIA A. QUAST Regional Counsel | |
|----------|---|--|
| 2 | EDGAR P. CORAL Assistant Regional Counsel | **FILED** 23 JULY 2021 U.S. EPA - REGION IX |
| 4 | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Region IX | U.S. EPA - REGIO |
| 5 | 75 Hawthorne Street San Francisco, CA 94105 | TGION IX |
| 6 | (415) 972-3898 | |
| 7 | ENVIRONMENTAL | D STATES PROTECTION AGENCY GION IX |
| 9 | | |
| 10 11 | In the matter of: | Docket No. FIFRA-09-2021-0057 |
| 12 | Forma Brands LLC, |) |
| 13 14 | Respondent. | pursuant to 40 C.F.R. §§ 22.13(b), 22.18(b)(2), and 22.18(b)(3) |
| 15 16 | I. <u>CONSENT AGREEMENT</u> | |
| 17 | The United States Environmental Protection Agency ("EPA"), Region IX, and Forma | |
| 18 | Brands LLC ("Respondent") agree to settle this matter and consent to the entry of this Consent | |
| 19 | Agreement and Final Order ("CAFO"). This CAFO simultaneously initiates and concludes this | |
| 20 | proceeding in accordance with 40 C.F.R. §§ 22 | |
| 21 | A. <u>AUTHORITY AND PARTIES</u> | |
| 22 | 1. This is a civil administrative action brought pursuant to Section 14(a)(1) of the Federal | |
| 23 | Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act ("FIFRA"), 7 U.S.C. § 136 <i>l</i> (a)(1), for (1) the sale | |
| 24 | and/or distribution of a misbranded pesticidal device in violation of Section 12(a)(1)(F) of | |
| 25 | FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(F), and (2) the fa | nilure to file a report required by FIFRA (e.g., a |
| 26 | "Notice of Arrival" for an imported pesticide or device) in violation of Section 12(a)(2)(N) of | |
| 27 | FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(N). | |
| 28 | 2. Complainant is the Manager of the Toxics Section in the Enforcement and | |
| | Compliance Assurance Division, EPA Region | IX, who has been duly delegated the authority to |

bring this action and to sign a consent agreement settling this action.

3. Respondent is Forma Brands LLC (parent company to Morphe, LLC), a California corporation with headquarter offices located at 22 4th Street, Floor 4, in San Francisco, California, 94103-3172.

B. STATUTORY AND REGULATORY BASIS

- 4. Section 12(a)(1)(F) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(F), provides that it shall be unlawful for any person to distribute or sell to any person a pesticidal device which is misbranded.
- 5. Section 2(s) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(s), defines a "person" as any individual, partnership, association, corporation, or any organized group of persons whether incorporated or not.
- 6. Section 2(gg) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(gg), defines the term "distribute or sell" to mean to distribute, sell, offer for sale, hold for distribution, hold for sale, hold for shipment, ship, deliver for shipment, release for shipment, or receive and (having so received) deliver or offer to deliver.
- 7. Section 2(t) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(t), defines a "pest" as any insect, rodent, nematode, fungus, weed, or any other form of terrestrial or aquatic plant or animal life or virus, bacteria, or other micro-organism (except viruses, bacteria, or other living micro-organisms on or in living man or other living animals) which the Administrator declares to be a pest under Section 25(c)(1) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136w(c)(1).
- 8. Section 2(h) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(h), defines a "device," in part, as any instrument or contrivance (other than a firearm) which is intended for trapping, destroying, repelling, or mitigating any pest or any other form of plant or animal life.
- 9. Section 2(q)(1)(D) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(q)(1)(D), states that a pesticide is misbranded if its label does not bear the registration number assigned under Section 7 to each establishment in which it was produced.
- 10. Section 2(p)(1) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(p)(1), defines "label" as the written, printed, or graphic matter on, or attached to, the pesticide or device or any of its containers or

wrappers.

- 11. Section 2(p)(2)(A) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(p)(2)(A), defines "labeling," in part, as all labels and all other written, printed or graphic matter accompanying the pesticide or device at any time.
- 12. Forty C.F.R. § 156.10(a)(1)(v) states that every pesticide product shall bear a label containing, inter alia, the producing establishment number as prescribed in paragraph (f) of this section.
- 13. Forty C.F.R. § 156.10(f) states that the producing establishment registration number preceded by the phrase "EPA Est.", of the final establishment at which the product was produced may appear in any suitable location on the label or immediate container.
- 14. The importation of pesticides and devices into the United States is governed by Sections 17(c) and (e) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. §§ 136*o*(c) and 136*o*(e), and the regulations promulgated thereunder by the Secretary of the Treasury in consultation with the Administrator of the EPA (the "Administrator"). These regulations are found at 19 C.F.R. Part 12.
- 15. 19 C.F.R. § 12.112 states, in part, that an importer desiring to import pesticides or devices into the United States shall submit to the Administrator a Notice of Arrival of Pesticides and Devices (Environmental Protection Agency Form 3540-1, or "Notice of Arrival"), prior to the arrival of the shipment in the United States. In the alternative, the importer or the importer's agent may file an electronic equivalent to the Notice of Arrival. See also Section 17(c) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 1360(c).
- 16. Section 12(a)(2)(N) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(N), makes it unlawful for any person who is a registrant, wholesaler, dealer, retailer, or other distributor (*e.g.*, importer) to fail to file reports required by FIFRA.
- 17. The Administrator of EPA may assess a civil penalty against any registrant, commercial applicator, wholesaler, dealer, retailer, or other distributor who violates any provision of FIFRA of up to \$20,528 for each offense that occurred after November 2, 2015 where penalties are assessed on or after December 23, 2020. See Section 14(a)(1) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136*l*(a)(1); 40 C.F.R. Part 19; and Civil Monetary Penalty Inflation Adjustment Rule at

85 Fed. Reg. 83818 (December 23, 2020).

C. ALLEGED VIOLATIONS

- 18. At all times relevant to this CAFO, Respondent was a corporation and therefore a "person" as that term is defined by Section 2(s) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(s), and as such is subject to FIFRA and the regulations promulgated thereunder.
- 19. At all times relevant to this CAFO, the label and/or labeling for the "Morphe UV Disinfection Box" product bore claims that it "kills up to 99.9% of germs in 3 minutes," "disinfect[s]," "sanitizes," and "steriliz[es]." The "Morphe UV Disinfection Box" product is thus an instrument or contrivance (other than a firearm) which is intended for trapping, destroying, repelling, or mitigating any "pest," as that term is defined by Section 2(t) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(t), and is thereby a "device," as that term is defined in Section 2(h) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(h).
- 20. On or about December 18, 2020, Respondent "distributed or sold," as that term is defined by Section 2(gg) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(gg), the "Morphe UV Disinfection Box" device by importing it into the United States.
- 21. The label on the "Morphe UV Disinfection Box" device that Respondent imported into the United States on or about December 18, 2020, did not bear the registration number assigned under Section 7 to the establishment in which it was produced.
- 22. Respondent's failure to identify on the label the EPA producing establishment registration number of the final establishment in which the "Morphe UV Disinfection Box" device was produced, as required by 40 C.F.R. §§ 156.10(a)(1)(v) and 156.10(f), constitutes "misbranding," as that term is defined by Section 2(q)(1)(D) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(q)(1)(D).
- 23. Consequently, the distribution/importation into the United Sates of the "Morphe UV Disinfection Box" device by the Respondent on or about December 18, 2020, constitutes one violation of Section 12(a)(1)(E) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(E).
- 24. On or about December 18, 2020, Respondent failed to submit to the EPA a complete and accurate Notice of Arrival (or a digital alternative pursuant to the U.S. Department of Homeland Security, Bureau of Customs and Border Protection's ("CBP") Automated

Consent Agreement and Final Order
In re Forma Brands LLC

Commercial Environment ("ACE") system) for the importation into the United States of the "Morphe UV Disinfection Box" device prior to the arrival of its shipment under Entry Number CHQ-07197504 in the United States as required by Section 17(c) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136o(c), and 19 C.F.R. § 12.112. While a Notice of Arrival had been filed via the ACE system prior to the shipment's arrival, it presented an erroneous EPA establishment number and failed to provide required photographs of the product label and was thus incomplete and inaccurate.

- 25. On or about December 27, 2020, Respondent failed to submit to the EPA a complete and accurate Notice of Arrival (or a digital alternative pursuant to CBP's ACE system) for the importation into the United States of the "Morphe UV Disinfection Box" device prior to the arrival of its shipment under Entry Number CHQ-07221668 in the United States as required by Section 17(c) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 1360(c), and 19 C.F.R. § 12.112. While a Notice of Arrival had been filed via the ACE system prior to the shipment's arrival, it presented an erroneous EPA establishment number and failed to provide required photographs of the product label and was thus incomplete and inaccurate.
- 26. By failing to submit to the EPA a complete and accurate Notice of Arrival (or a digital alternative pursuant to CBP's ACE system) for the importation into the United States of the "Morphe UV Disinfection Box" device prior to the arrival of each of the aforementioned two shipments in the United States on or about December 18, 2020, and December 27, 2020, Respondent failed to file a report required by FIFRA in each instance and thus committed two violations of Section 12(a)(2)(N) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(N).

D. RESPONDENT'S ADMISSIONS

27. In accordance with 40 C.F.R. § 22.18(b)(2) and for the purpose of this proceeding, Respondent: (i) admits that EPA has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this CAFO and over Respondent; (ii) neither admits nor denies the specific factual allegations contained in Section I.C of this CAFO; (iii) consents to any and all conditions specified in this CAFO and to the assessment of the civil administrative penalty under Section I.E of this CAFO; (iv) waives any right to contest the allegations contained in this CAFO; and (v) waives the right to appeal the proposed Final Order contained in this CAFO.

E. CIVIL ADMINISTRATIVE PENALTY

| 28. In full and final settlement of the violations specifically alleged in Section I.C of this | | |
|---|--|--|
| CAFO, Respondent shall pay a civil administrative penalty of TWENTY-TWO THOUSAND | | |
| AND EIGHTY-THREE DOLLARS (\$22,083). Respondent shall pay this civil penalty within | | |
| thirty (30) days of the effective date of this CAFO. The civil penalty shall be paid by remitting a | | |
| certified or cashier's check, including the name and docket number of this case, for the amount, | | |
| payable to "Treasurer, United States of America," (or be paid by one of the other methods listed | | |
| below) and sent as follows: | | |

9

10

11

12

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

Regular Mail:

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Fines and Penalties Cincinnati Finance Center PO Box 979077 St. Louis, MO 63197-9000

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

Wire Transfers:

Wire transfers must be sent directly to the Federal Reserve Bank in New York City with the following information:
Federal Reserve Bank of New York
ABA = 021030004
Account = 68010727
SWIFT address = FRNYUS33

33 Liberty Street
New York, NY 10045

Beneficiary = U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

Certified or Overnight Mail:

U.S. Bank 1005 Convention Plaza Mail Station SL-MO-C2GL ATTN Box 979077 St. Louis, MO 63101

ACH (also known as Remittance Express or REX):

Automated Clearinghouse (ACH) payments to EPA can be made through the U.S. Treasury using the following information:

U.S. Treasury REX/Cashlink ACH Receiver ABA = 051036706 Account = 31006, Environmental Protection Agency CTX Format Transaction Code 22 – checking

Physical location of U.S. Treasury facility:

2728

| 1 2 | 5700 Rivertech Court Riverdale, MD 20737 | | |
|----------|--|--|--|
| 3 | Remittance Express (REX) = (866) 234-5681 | | |
| 4 | On Line Payment: | | |
| 5 | This payment option can be accessed from the information below: | | |
| 6 | www.pay.gov Enter "SFO 1.1" in the search field | | |
| 7 | Open form and complete required fields | | |
| 8 | If clarification regarding a particular method of payment remittance is needed, contact the EPA's Cincinnati Finance Center at (513) 487-2091. | | |
| 10 | A copy of each check, or notification that the payment has been made by one of the other | | |
| 11 | methods listed above, including proof of the date payment was made, shall be sent with a | | |
| 12 | transmittal letter, indicating Respondent's name, the case title, and docket number, to the | | |
| 13 | following regular mail or email addresses: | | |
| 14 | Regional Hearing Clerk | | |
| 15 | Office of Regional Counsel (ORC-1) U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region IX | | |
| 16 17 | 75 Hawthorne Street San Francisco, CA 94105 R9HearingClerk@epa.gov | | |
| 18 | Brandon Boatman | | |
| 19 | Toxics Section Enforcement and Compliance Assurance Division (ENF-2-3) U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region IX | | |
| 20 | 75 Hawthorne Street San Francisco, CA 94105 | | |
| 21 | boatman.brandon@epa.gov | | |
| 22 | 29. Respondent shall not use payment of any penalty under this CAFO as a tax deduction | | |
| 23 | from Respondent's federal, state, or local taxes, nor shall Respondent allow any other person to | | |
| 24 | use such payment as a tax deduction. | | |
| 25 | 30. If Respondent fails to pay the assessed civil administrative penalty of TWENTY- | | |
| 26 | TWO THOUSAND AND EIGHTY-THREE DOLLARS (\$22,083), as identified in Paragraph | | |
| 27 | 28, by the deadline specified in that Paragraph, then Respondent shall pay a stipulated penalty to | | |
| ∠ 0 | EPA of FIVE HUNDRED DOLLARS (\$500) per day in addition to the assessed penalty. | | |
| | Consent Agreement and Final Order In re Forma Brands LLC Page 7 | | |

Stipulated penalties shall accrue until such time as the assessed penalty and all accrued stipulated penalties are paid and shall become due and payable upon EPA's written request. Failure to pay the civil administrative penalty specified in Paragraph 28 by the deadline specified in that Paragraph may also lead to any or all of the following actions:

- (1) EPA may refer the debt to a credit reporting agency, a collection agency, or to the Department of Justice for filing of a collection action in the appropriate United States District Court. 40 C.F.R. §§ 13.13, 13.14 and 13.33. The validity, amount, and appropriateness of the assessed penalty or of this CAFO is not subject to review in any such collection proceeding.
- (*i.e.*, the withholding of money payable by the United States to, or held by the United States for, a person to satisfy the debt the person owes the U.S. Government), which includes, but is not limited to, referral to the Internal Revenue Service for offset against income tax refunds. 40 C.F.R. §§ 13(C) and 13(H).
- (3) Pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 13.17, EPA may either: (i) suspend or revoke Respondent's licenses or other privileges, or (ii) suspend or disqualify Respondent from doing business with EPA or engaging in programs EPA sponsors or funds.
- (4) Pursuant to 31 U.S.C. § 3701 *et seq.* and 40 C.F.R. Part 13, the U.S. Government may assess interest, administrative handling charges, and nonpayment penalties against the outstanding amount that Respondent owes to EPA for Respondent's failure to pay the civil administrative penalty specified in Paragraph 28 by the deadline specified in that Paragraph.
- (a) Interest. Pursuant to 31 U.S.C. § 3717 and 40 C.F.R. §13.11(a)(1), any unpaid portion of the assessed penalty shall bear interest at the rate established according to 26 U.S.C. § 6621(a)(2) from the effective date of this CAFO, provided, however, that no interest shall be payable on any portion of the assessed penalty that is paid within thirty (30) days of the effective date of this CAFO.
- (b) Administrative Handling Charges. Pursuant to 31 U.S.C. Section 3717(e)(1) and 40 C.F.R. § 13.11(b), Respondent shall pay a monthly handling charge,

based on either actual or average cost incurred (including both direct and indirect costs), for every month in which any portion of the assessed penalty is more than thirty (30) days past due.

(c) Nonpayment Penalties. Pursuant to 31 U.S.C. § 3717(e)(2) and 40 C.F.R. § 13.11(c), a monthly penalty charge, not to exceed six percent (6%) annually, may be assessed on all debts more than ninety (90) days delinquent.

F. CERTIFICATION OF COMPLIANCE

31. In executing this CAFO, Respondent certifies that the information it has supplied concerning this matter was at the time of submission, and is at the time of signature to this CAFO, truthful, accurate, and complete; and that Respondent has corrected the violations alleged in Section I.C of this CAFO. Under 18 U.S.C. § 1001, submitting false or misleading information can result in significant penalties, including the possibility of fines and imprisonment for knowing submission of such information.

G. RETENTION OF RIGHTS

- 32. In accordance with 40 C.F.R. § 22.18(c), this CAFO only resolves Respondent's liabilities for federal civil penalties for the violations and facts specifically alleged in Section I.C of this CAFO. Nothing in this CAFO is intended to or shall be construed to resolve: (i) any civil liability for violations of any provision of any federal, state, or local law, statute, regulation, rule, ordinance, or permit not specifically alleged in Section I.C of this CAFO; or (ii) any criminal liability. EPA specifically reserves any and all authorities, rights, and remedies available to it (including, but not limited to, injunctive or other equitable relief or criminal sanctions) to address any violation of this CAFO or any violation not specifically alleged in Section I.C of this CAFO.
- 33. This CAFO does not exempt, relieve, modify, or affect in any way Respondent's duties to comply with all applicable federal, state, and local laws, regulations, rules, ordinances, and permits.

H. ATTORNEYS' FEES AND COSTS

34. Each party shall bear its own attorneys' fees, costs, and disbursements incurred in this proceeding.

I. EFFECTIVE DATE 1 35. In accordance with 40 C.F.R. §§ 22.18(b)(3) and 22.31(b), this CAFO shall be 2 effective on the date that the Final Order contained in this CAFO, having been approved and 3 issued by either the Regional Judicial Officer or Regional Administrator, is filed. 4 J. BINDING EFFECT 5 36. The undersigned representative of Complainant and the undersigned representative of 6 Respondent each certifies that he or she is fully authorized to enter into the terms and conditions of this CAFO and to bind the party he or she represents to this CAFO. 8 37. The provisions of this CAFO shall apply to and be binding upon Respondent and its 9 officers, directors, employees, agents, trustees, servants, authorized representatives, successors, 10 and assigns. 11 12 13 FOR RESPONDENT FORMA BRANDS LLC: 14 15 02-JUL-2021 16 DATE Director, Logistics and Trade Compliance 17 Forma Brands LLC 22 4th Street, Floor 4 18 San Francisco, CA 94103-3172 19 20 FOR COMPLAINANT EPA: 21 Digitally signed by MATTHEW MATTHEW SALAZAR Date: 2021.07.15 22 SALAZAR 7/15/2021 11:22:05 -07'00' DATE MATT SALAZAR, P.E. 23 Manager, Toxics Section Enforcement and Compliance Assurance Division 24 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region IX 25 26 27 28

| | 1 |
|---|---|
| | 2 |
| | 3 |
| | 4 |
| | 5 |
| | 6 |
| | 7 |
| | 8 |
| | 9 |
| 1 | 0 |
| 1 | 1 |
| 1 | 2 |
| 1 | 3 |
| 1 | 4 |
| 1 | 5 |
| 1 | 6 |
| 1 | 7 |
| 1 | 8 |
| 1 | 9 |
| 2 | 0 |
| 2 | 1 |
| 2 | 2 |
| 2 | 3 |
| 2 | 4 |
| 2 | 5 |
| 2 | 6 |

28

II. FINAL ORDER

EPA and Forma Brands LLC having entered into the foregoing Consent Agreement, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that this CAFO (Docket No. FIFRA-09-2021-0057) be entered, and Respondent shall pay a civil administrative penalty in the amount of TWENTY-TWO THOUSAND AND EIGHTY-THREE DOLLARS (\$22,083) and comply with the terms and conditions set forth in the Consent Agreement.

STEVEN JAWGIEL JAWGIEL

Digitally signed by STEVEN JAWGIEL

Date: 2021.07.22 08:41:43 -07'00'

DATE

STEVEN JAWGIEL Regional Judicial Officer

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region IX

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL

This is to certify that the fully executed Consent Agreement and Final Order (Docket No. FIFRA-09-2021-0057) was filed with the Regional Hearing Clerk and a true and correct copy of the same was sent to the following parties:

| For Respondent: | Brenda Alvarez Director, Logistics and Trade Compliance Forma Brands LLC 22 Fourth Street (Floor 4) San Francisco, CA 94103-3172 Brenda.Alvarez@formabrands.com |
|---|---|
| For Complainant: | VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL Edgar Coral Assistant Regional Counsel (ORC-2) U.S. EPA, Region IX 75 Hawthorne Street San Francisco, CA 94105 Coral.Edgar@epa.gov |
| Armsey, Digitally signed by Armsey, Steven Date: 2021.07.23 20:44:14-07'00' | |
| Regional Hearing Clerk U.S. EPA Region IX | Date |